Zbigniew Jelonek

On the Cancellation Problem

Published as manuscript

Received 15 April 2007
ON THE CANCELLATION PROBLEM

ZBIGNIEW JELONEK

Abstract. Let $k$ be an algebraically closed field. For every $n \geq 8$ we give examples of Zariski open, dense, affine subsets of the affine space $A^n(k)$ which do not have the cancellation property.

1. Introduction.

Let $k$ be an algebraically closed field and let $X$ be an affine variety over $k$. We say that $X$ has the cancellation property (CP) if for every affine variety $Y$, if $X \times k \cong Y \times k$, then $X \cong Y$.

There exist smooth affine varieties without CP (see [2], [3], [5], [6]); all the examples given so far are based on the so called Danielewski construction. It is an interesting and in general still open problem whether the affine space $A^n(k)$ has CP. Here, using a new approach, we show that for every $n \geq 8$ there are Zariski open, dense affine subsets of $A^n(k)$ without CP.

Our idea is as follows. Let $X$ be a smooth affine variety. Denote a trivial algebraic vector bundle of rank $r$ on $X$ by $E_r$. Assume that $X$ admits an algebraic vector bundle $F$ which is stably trivial (of type 1), i.e., $F \oplus E_1 = E_{n+1}$, but not trivial. Let $F$ denote the total space of $F$. We have

$$F \times k \cong X \times k^{n+1} \cong (X \times k^n) \times k,$$

but we show that $F \not\cong X \times k^n$ if $X$ is not $k$–uniruled.

Accordingly, to find an affine variety without CP it is enough to find a smooth affine non-$k$–uniruled variety with a stably trivial, but not trivial algebraic vector bundle on it. In particular we obtain in this way the following example. Let $n \geq 3$ be an integer. Consider the polynomial $h(x, y) = \sum_{i=1}^n x_i y_i \in k[x_1, \ldots, x_n; y_1, \ldots, y_n]$. Now let

$$X_{2n} = \{(x, y) \in k^{2n} : h(x, y) \neq 0, 1+x_i(h(x, y)−1) \neq 0, 1+y_i(h(x, y)−1) \neq 0, i = 1, \ldots, n \}.$$

Then the cylinder $Y_{3n−1} = X_{2n} \times k^{n−1}$ (which is a Zariski open, dense subset of $A^{3n−1}(k)$) does not have CP. We also show that for every $m \geq 8$, we can find a Zariski open, dense affine subset $U_m$ of $A^m(k)$ which fails CP.

2. Preliminaries

Let $X$ be an affine variety (which is assumed to be irreducible) over $k$ and let $R = k[X]$ be the ring of polynomial functions on $X$. Let us recall some basic facts about algebraic
vector bundles over $X$, which we identify with finitely generated projective $R$–modules. We say that an algebraic vector bundle $E$ is stably trivial (of type $t$) if
\[ E \oplus E_t = E_s \]
for some trivial vector bundles $E_t$ and $E_s$. Recall that a sequence $(f_1, \ldots, f_r) \in R^r$ is called a unimodular row if $(f_1, \ldots, f_r) = R$ (as an ideal). This is equivalent to the fact that $f_1, \ldots, f_r$ have no common zeros on $X$. A unimodular row $f = (f_1, \ldots, f_r) \in R^r$ determines uniquely a vector bundle $F(f) = R^r/Rf$. Of course $F \oplus E_1 = E_r$. It is easy to see that the vector bundle $F(f)$ is trivial if and only if the unimodular row $f = (f_1, \ldots, f_r)$ can be extended to an $n \times n$ matrix with determinant 1. In other words, $F(f)$ is trivial if and only if there exists a matrix $[f_{ij}] \in R^{n^2}$ such that
1) $\det [f_{ij}] = 1$,
2) $f_i = f_{1i}$ for $i = 1, \ldots, n$.

3. OPEN SUBSETS OF $A^n(k)$ WITHOUT THE CANCELLATION PROPERTY

Let us recall the definition of a $k$–uniruled variety which was introduced in our paper [7]. First recall that an affine parametric line in $X$ is the image of the affine line $A^1(k)$ under a non constant morphism $\phi : A^1(k) \to X$. Now we have:

**Definition 3.1.** An affine variety $X$ is said to be $k$–uniruled if it is of dimension $\geq 1$ and there exists a Zariski open, non-empty subset $U$ of $X$ such that for every point $x \in U$ there is a parametric affine line in $X$ passing through $x$.

We have the following important examples of non-$k$–uniruled varieties:

**Proposition 3.2.** Let $h \in k[x_1, \ldots, x_n]$ be a non-constant polynomial. The variety
\[ X(h) = \{ x \in k^n : h(x) \neq 0, \ 1 + x_i(h(x) - 1) \neq 0 \text{ for } i = 1, \ldots, n \} \]
is not $k$–uniruled.

**Proof.** Let $\phi : k \to X(h)$ be a regular mapping. Thus $\phi = (\phi_1(t), \ldots, \phi_n(t))$, where $\phi_i$ are polynomials. Moreover $h \circ \phi \neq 0$ for every $t$, which implies that $h \circ \phi$ is a non-zero constant. Similarly $1 + \phi_i(t)(h \circ \phi(t) - 1)$ is a constant. Consequently, either $h \circ \phi(t) = 1$ or all $\phi_i$ are constant. This means that outside the hypersurface $\{ x \in k^n : h(x) = 1 \}$ there are no affine parametric curves in $X(h)$.

In the sequel we need the following nice elementary lemma, which was proved in [4] (for the sake of completeness we include a proof):

**Lemma 3.3.** Let $f : U \times k^r \to X$ be a dominant morphism of affine varieties. If there is $u \in U$ such that $\dim f(\{u\} \times k^r) > 0$ then $X$ is $k$–uniruled.

**Proof.** We can assume that $X \subset k^m$. Hence $f = (f_1, \ldots, f_m)$. Let $Z = \{ u \in U : \dim f(\{u\} \times k^r) = 0 \}$. The set $Z$ is closed in $U$. Indeed $Z = \bigcap_{t \in k^r} \{ u \in U : f_i(u, t) = f_i(u, s) \text{ for } i = 1, \ldots, m \}$. By the assumption we have $Z \neq U$. Since the mapping $f$ is dominant and the variety $(U \setminus Z) \times k^r$ is dense in $U \times k^r$, we have that also the mapping $f : (U \setminus Z) \times k^r \to X$ is dominant. Let $l_u$ denote a line in $k^r$ passing through $0$, such that the mapping $f$ restricted to $\{u\} \times l$ is not constant. We have $f((U \setminus Z) \times k^r) = \bigcup_{u \in U \setminus Z} l_u \cap f(\{u\} \times l_u)$. Since the set $f((U \setminus Z) \times k^r)$ contains a Zariski open subset of $X$, the proof is complete.

The following observation is important for this paper:
Theorem 3.4. Let $X$ be a non-$k$–uniruled smooth affine variety. Let $F$ be an algebraic vector bundle on $X$ of rank $r$. If the total space of $F$ is isomorphic to $X \times k^r$, then $F$ is a trivial vector bundle.

Proof. Let $F$ denote the total space of $F$. In what follows, we will identify $X$ with the zero section $X \times \{0\} \subset F$. Note that 

$$F = TF|_{X/TX}.$$ 

Assume that there exists an isomorphism $\Phi : F \to X \times k^r$. Let $\pi : X \times k^r \to X$ be the projection and take $f = \pi \circ \Phi$. Since the vector bundle $F$ is locally trivial in the Zariski topology, Lemma 3.3 shows that $\Phi(F_x) = f(x) \times k^r$ for every $x \in X$. Consequently, the mapping $\sigma := f|X : X \to X$ is an isomorphism. Let $\Sigma = \sigma^{-1} \times \text{identity} : X \times k^r \ni (x, t) \mapsto (\sigma^{-1}(x), t) \in X \times k^r$. If we replace $\Phi$ by $\Sigma \circ \Phi$ then $\sigma = \text{identity}$.

In particular $\Phi : X \in x \mapsto (x, t(x)) \in X \times k^r$. Let us denote coordinates in the product $X \times k^r$ by $(x, t_1, \ldots, t_r)$. By the above, we have $t_i = t_i(x) \mod I(\Phi(X))$. Consider the isomorphism $G : X \times k^r \ni (x, t) \mapsto (x, t - t(x)) \in X \times k^r$. Again we can replace $\Phi$ by $G \circ \Phi$ to obtain $\Phi|X : X \times \{0\} \ni (x, 0) \mapsto (x, 0) \in X \times k^r$. Hence we can assume that $\Phi$ transforms the zero section into the zero section, and moreover it induces the identity on the zero section. Hence $d\Phi(TX) = TX$ and the mapping 

$$d\Phi : TF|_{X/TX} \cong F \to T(X \times k^r)|_{X/TX} \cong E_r$$

is an isomorphism. Consequently, the bundle $F$ is trivial. □

Now we give examples of Zariski open, affine subsets of $A^n(k)$ which do not have the cancellation property. We start with the following nice classical example of Raynaud (see [8] for $k = \mathbb{C}$ and [9] for an arbitrary field $k$):

Example 3.5. Let $n \geq 3$ and 

$$R = \frac{k[x_1, \ldots, x_n, y_1, \ldots, y_n]}{(\sum_{i=1}^{n} x_i y_i - 1)}.$$ 

Then the stably free submodule of $R^n$ given by the unimodular row $(x_1, \ldots, x_n)$ is not free.

Now we can prove our main result.

Theorem 3.6. Let $n \geq 3$ be an integer and let $h = \sum_{i=1}^{n} x_i y_i \in k[x_1, \ldots, x_n; y_1, \ldots, y_n]$. Define 

$$X_{2n}(h) = \{(x, y) \in k^{2n} : h(x, y) \neq 0, 1 + x_i (h(x, y) - 1) \neq 0, 1 + y_i (h(x, y) - 1) \neq 0, i = 1, \ldots, n \}.$$ 

Then the cylinder $Y_{3n-1} = X_{2n} \times k^{n-1}$ (which is a Zariski open, dense affine subset of $k^{3n-1}$) fails CP.

Proof. Let $Z = \{(x, y) \in k^{2n} : h(x, y) = 1\}$. By the Raynaud example we know that a row $(x_1, \ldots, x_n)$ which is unimodular on $Z$ cannot be extended on $Z$ to an $n \times n$ matrix with determinant 1 (cf. section 2). Let us note that this row is also unimodular on the variety $X_{2n}(h)$. Indeed, we have $\sum_{i=1}^{n} x_i y_i = h \neq 0$ on $X_{2n}(h)$. I claim that this row cannot be extended on $X_{2n}(h)$ to an $n \times n$ matrix with determinant 1. To see this, first note that $Z \subset X_{2n}(h)$. Now, the restriction to $Z$ of such a matrix would give a similar matrix on $Z$, a contradiction. From this we conclude that a unimodular row $(x_1, \ldots, x_n)$ determines on $X_{2n}(h)$ a non-trivial algebraic vector bundle $F$. In particular we have $F \oplus E_1 = E_n$ and $F$ is a non-trivial vector bundle. Let us denote by $F$ the total space of $F$. Then 

$$F \times k \cong X_{2n}(h) \times k^n \cong (X_{2n}(h) \times k^{n-1}) \times k.$$
Since the variety $X_{2n}(h)$ is not $k$–uniruled (see Proposition 3.2), Theorem 3.4 shows that the variety $F$ is not isomorphic to the cylinder $X_{2n}(h) \times k^{n-1}$. □

**Remark 3.7.** If we have one open subvariety $X_{2n}(h) \subset k^{3n-1}$ without CP, we can easily construct infinitely many pairwise non-isomorphic open subvarieties of this type. Indeed, choose sufficiently general polynomials $a_i \in k[x,y]$, $i = 1, 2, \ldots$. Let $Y_k = \{(x, y) \in X_{2n}(h) : 1 \neq a_i(1-h), i = 1, \ldots, k\}$. In this way we obtain a strictly descending sequence of open subvarieties $Y_0 \supset Y_1 \supset Y_2 \supset \ldots$, which do not have CP. They are pairwise non-isomorphic by the Ax Theorem (see [1]).

By a slight modification of the proof of Theorem 3.6 we get:

**Theorem 3.8.** For every $n \geq 8$, we can find a Zariski open, dense affine subset $U_n$ of $A^n(k)$ which fails CP.

**Proof.** Let $n = 8 + s$. Consider the ring $R = k[x_1, x_2, x_3, y_1, y_2, y_3, z_1, \ldots, z_s]$. Let $h = \sum_{i=1}^{3} x_i y_i \in R$. Define

$$Y_{n-2}(h) = \{(x, y, z) \in k^3 \times k^3 \times k^s : h(x, y) \neq 0, 1 + x_i(h(x, y) - 1) \neq 0, 1 + y_i(h(x, y) - 1) \neq 0, i = 1, 2, 3; \ z_j \neq 0 \text{ for } j = 1, \ldots, s \}.$$ 

As in the proof of Proposition 3.2 we see that the variety $Y_{n-2}(h)$ is not $k$–uniruled.

Let $Z' = \{(x, y, z) \in k^3 \times k^3 \times k^s : h(x, y) = 1; \ z_j = 1 \text{ for every } j = 1, \ldots, s \}$. By the Raynaud example we know that a row $(x_1, x_2, x_3)$ which is unimodular on $Z'$ cannot be extended on $Z'$ to a $3 \times 3$ matrix with determinant 1. This row is also unimodular on the variety $Y_{n-2}(h)$ and it also cannot be extended on $Y_{n-2}(h)$ to a $3 \times 3$ matrix with a determinant 1. Indeed, the restriction to $Z'$ of such a matrix would give a similar matrix on $Z'$, a contradiction. From this, as before, we conclude that a unimodular row $(x_1, x_2, x_3)$ determines on $Y_{n-2}(h)$ a non-trivial algebraic vector bundle $F$. Now arguing as in the proof of Theorem 3.6 we see that the variety $U_n = Y_{n-2}(h) \times k^2$ does not have CP. □

**Corollary 3.9.** Let $n \geq 8$. Then there exists a non-zero polynomial $g \in k[x_1, \ldots, x_n]$ and a finitely generated $k$–algebra $F$ such that

$$k[x_1, \ldots, x_n]g \otimes_k k[T] = F \otimes_k k[T]$$

but $k[x_1, \ldots, x_n]g \not\cong F$.

**References**

(Z. Jelonek) Instytut Matematyczny, Polska Akademia Nauk, Św. Tomasza 30, 31-027 Kraków, Poland.

E-mail address: najelone@cyf-kr.edu.pl